

## **CITY AND COUNTY OF SWANSEA**

### **MINUTES OF THE PLANNING COMMITTEE**

**HELD AT COUNCIL CHAMBER, GUILDHALL, SWANSEA ON TUESDAY,  
6 DECEMBER 2016 AT 2.00 PM**

**PRESENT:** Councillor P Lloyd (Chair) Presided

**Councillor(s)**

P M Black  
A M Cook  
H M Morris

**Councillor(s)**

A C S Colburn  
M H Jones  
D W W Thomas

**Councillor(s)**

D W Cole  
E T Kirchner

**Apologies for Absence**

Councillor(s): P B Smith, M Thomas and T M White

**Also Present:**

Councillors: S E Crouch, C R Doyle, P M Matthews, C E Lloyd, J A Hale & N J Davies

43 **DISCLOSURES OF PERSONAL AND PREJUDICIAL INTERESTS.**

In accordance with the Code of Conduct adopted by the City & County of Swansea, the following interests were declared:

Councillor E T Kirchner – Minute No.47 - Planning Applications 2016/1699(Item 2) & 2015/1731(Item 7) – I know one of the objectors.

Councillor P Lloyd – Minute No.47 - Planning Applications 2016/1699(Item 3) & 2015/1731(Item 7) – I know one of the objectors.

44 **MINUTES.**

**RESOLVED** that the Minutes of the Planning Committee held on 1 November 2016 be approved as a correct record.

45 **ITEMS FOR DEFERRAL / WITHDRAWAL.**

None.

46 **PROVISIONAL TPO P17.7.4.620 - LAND AT ST. MATTHEWS CHURCH, HIGH STREET, CITY CENTRE, SWANSEA. (2016).**

The Head of Economic Regeneration and Planning presented a report which sought consideration of the confirmation as a full order, the provisional TPO 620 at land at St Matthews Church, High Centre, Swansea.

The objections and representations received regarding the proposals were outlined.

**RESOLVED** that the Tree Preservation Order: Land at St. Matthews Church, High Street, Swansea. 2016; TPO P17.7.4.620 be confirmed without amendment.

47 **DETERMINATION OF PLANNING APPLICATIONS UNDER THE TOWN & COUNTRY PLANNING ACT 1990.**

A series of planning applications were presented on behalf of The Head of Planning & City Regeneration.

Amendments to this schedule were reported and are indicated below by (#)

**RESOLVED** that:

- (1) the undermentioned planning applications **BE APPROVED** subject to the conditions in the report and/or indicated below:

**#(Item 1) Planning Application 2016/1333 - Site J, Trawler Road, Swansea Marina, Swansea**

Helen Banner & Dr Paulus (objectors) addressed the committee and spoke against the application and Councillor S E Crouch (Local Member) also addressed the Committee and spoke against the application.

Phil Baxter (agent) addressed the committee and spoke in support of the application.

A visual presentation was provided.

Application approved in accordance with recommendation subject to the completion of a Section 106 agreement and the conditions outlined in the report.

**#(Item 2) Planning Application 2016/1699 - 19 Heol Caerllion, Cwmrhydyceirw, Swansea**

Stephen Jones & Stephen Polley (objectors) addressed the committee and spoke against the application.

Sarah Morris-Jones & Katie Allan (applicants) addressed the committee and spoke in support of the application.

A visual presentation was provided.

**#(Item 3) Planning Application 2016/1365 – Glais House Nursing house, 615 Birchgrove Road, Birchgrove**

Clifford Jones (objector) addressed the committee and spoke against the application and Councillor C R Doyle (Local Member) also addressed the Committee and spoke against the application. Councillor Doyle also proposed additional conditions regarding obscure glazing and construction traffic should the application be approved.

Tim Worsfold (agent) addressed the committee and spoke in support of the application.

A visual presentation was provided.

Report updated as follows – Call in also requested by Councillor P M Matthews.

Application approved in accordance with the recommendation subject to the following additional conditions:

13. Before the development hereby permitted is brought into use, the window in the north facing elevation, facing Station Road, shall be fitted with obscured glazing to a minimum level 3, details of which shall first be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority and any part of the window(s) that is less than 1.7m above the floor of the room in which it is installed shall be non-opening. The windows shall be permanently retained in that condition thereafter.

Reason: In the interests of conserving the privacy and amenity of adjoining properties.

14. No development shall take place until a scheme to control the hours during which delivery vehicles can enter and leave the site during the construction period of the development hereby approved, particularly at school starting and finishing times, has been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The approved scheme shall be adhered to at all times during the construction period.

Reason: To ensure there is no conflict between delivery vehicles and vehicles/pedestrians dropping off and collecting pupils from the nearby primary school, in the interests of highway safety and public safety.

**#(Item 4) Planning Application 2016/1312 – Lidl UK GMBH, Sway Road, Morriston**

Sophie Mathews (agent) addressed the committee and spoke in support of the application.

A visual presentation was provided.

Report updated as follows: Additional Conditions 9, 10 & 11 proposed.

Application approved subject to the addition of the following conditions:

9. The building hereby approved shall only be occupied by a Limited Assortment Discounter retailer.

Reason: To ensure the development does not have an adverse impact on the vitality and viability of existing shopping centres.

10. The gross retail floorspace hereby permitted shall not exceed 1424 square metres of which 285 square metres only may be used for the display and sale of comparison goods.

Reason: To ensure the development does not have an adverse impact on the vitality and viability of existing shopping centres.

11 The retail unit hereby permitted shall not be sub-divided to form more than one retail unit.

Reason: To ensure the development does not have an adverse impact on the vitality and viability of existing shopping centres.

**#(Item 6) Planning Application 2016/1472 – Former British Legion Site, Newton Road, Mumbles**

Ceri Jones (objector) addressed the committee and spoke against the application.

Phil Baxter (agent) addressed the committee and spoke in support of the application.

A visual presentation was provided.

Late letter of no objection from CADW reported.

Application approved subject to condition 12 being amended to read as follows:  
Delivery vehicles shall only be permitted within the site between the hours of 06:30hrs and 22:00hrs on any day. Deliveries to the proposed A1 use shall only take place between the hours of 06:30hrs and 22:00hrs on any day. All deliveries shall be made in strict accordance with the M&S Quiet Delivery Protocol received 28th November 2016.

**#(Item 7) Planning Application 2015/1731 – Land Off Madoc Place, Swansea**

Gordon Gibson (objector) addressed the committee and spoke against the application.

Elfed Roberts (applicant) addressed the committee and spoke in support of the application.

A visual presentation was provided.

2) the undermentioned planning applications **BE REFUSED** for the reasons set out below:

**#(Item 5) Planning Application 2016/3085/S73 – Land South of Fabian Way, Swansea**

Linda Summons (objector) addressed the committee and spoke against the application, and Councillor C E Lloyd & J A Hale (Local Members) also addressed the Committee and spoke against the application.

Dave Gill (agent) addressed the committee and spoke in support of the application.

A visual presentation was provided.

Report updated as follows:

Amendment to first paragraph, p101.

Replace "would remain valid" with "would only remain valid if the wording of the S106 was amended so that it made specific reference to this new planning application, and not the previously approved permission. The recommendation made to approve this application is therefore contingent on the original S106 being amended."

Amendment to recommendation proposed, as follows;

It is recommended that permission be granted subject to the conditions indicated below and the applicant entering into a S106 Deed of Variation, in order to amend the wording of the original S106 agreement (relating to planning permission 2015/2223) so that it instead makes specific reference to and hence is 'tied' to this planning application (2016/3085/FUL)

Application **REFUSED** contrary to officer recommendations for the following reasons:

The proposed extended opening hours of the tyre and auto-care centre would result in the creation of noise and disturbance between 1pm and 6pm on Saturdays, which would impact on the living conditions that the residents of Bevans Row could reasonably expect to enjoy, contrary to Policies EV1 and EV40 of the City and County of Swansea Unitary Development Plan 2008.

#### **#(Item 9) Planning Application 2016/1380 – 96 King Edward Road, Swansea**

Councillor N J Davies (Local Member) addressed the Committee and spoke against the application.

Alex Williams (applicant) addressed the committee and spoke in support of the application.

Report updated as follows:

Highways comments received from Head of Transportation and Engineering to the revised scheme of 7 bed HMO. In summary, no objection is made to the proposal as it is not considered that a refusal could be sustained at appeal and the parking being provided meets parking standards.

Replace "property" in Condition 3 with "use hereby approved".

Replace "dwelling" in Condition 5 with "use hereby approved".

Application **REFUSED** contrary to officer recommendations for the following reasons:

The proposal, in combination with existing Houses in Multiple Occupation (HMOs) within King Edwards Road will result in a harmful concentration and intensification of HMOs in the street and wider area. This cumulative impact will result in damage to the character of the area and social cohesion with higher levels of transient residents and fewer long term households and established families. Such impact will lead in the long term to communities which are not balanced and self-sustaining. As a result

the proposal is contrary to Policy HC5 criterion (ii) of the Swansea Unitary Development Plan (2008) and the National Policy aims set out in Planning Policy Wales (Edition 9 November 2016) of creating sustainable and inclusive mixed communities.

3) the undermentioned planning application **BE DEFERRED** under the **two stage voting process** for further officer advice on the issues raised by Members.

**#(Item 8) Planning Application 2016/1604 – 3 Lewis Street, St Thomas, Swansea**

Nick Holley, Chris Williams & John Row (objectors) addressed the committee and spoke against the application, and Councillor C E Lloyd & J A Hale (Local Members) also addressed the Committee and spoke against the application.

A visual presentation was provided.

4) the following items were not determined by Committee as the meeting became inquorate.

**(Item 10) Planning Application 2016/1860 – 115 Rhydings Terrace, Brynmill, Swansea**

**(Item 11) Planning Application 2016/3076/FUL – 124 St Helens Avenue, Brynmill, Swansea**

**Planning Appeal Decision - 2016/0873 - 8 Alexandra Terrace, Brynmill - Change of use from residential (Class C3) to HMO for up to six people (Class C4).**

The meeting ended at 6.10 pm

**CHAIR**